Analysis of Outcomes for Bachelor Degree-Seeking Transfers at 4-Year Institutions in Illinois



For discussion purposes only

Bachelor Degree-Seeking New Transfers at Illinois 4-Year Institutions

- I have conducted a research study that will illustrate to what degree transfer students in Illinois 4-year institutions are successful and what factors are associated with bachelor completion.
- The first analysis will exclusively use IHEIS data. That is IBHE's student level data collection. It will focus on retention, advancement, and 4-year graduation rates for the outcomes.
- The second analysis will use IHEIS data that has been matched with National Student Clearinghouse (NSC) data. The goal is to find meaningful predictive variables and use the variables to analyze the graduation results over a 6-year period.



Transfers IHEIS Analysis of Retention and Advancement



Retention and Advancement

- Retention is a leading indicator of graduation. If a student makes it to their second year, the probability of graduation is higher than a freshman.
- Advancement is an indicator of a student accumulating credit from their initial class level to the subsequent higher class level. Unsurprisingly, advancement is highly correlated to graduation.



IHEIS Cohort Analysis

- Included in the retention and advancement tables are bachelor degree-seeking students who transferred in Fall 2018-Fall 2021 to an Illinois 4-year institution.
- All student and college variables are set for a student as of the time of the fall transfer.
- We are using the traditional (IPEDS) retention and graduation measures. To be retained or graduated a student must be at the same institution they transferred to at the creation of the cohort.
- The graduation data has a 4-year time window. Future analyses will increase this to a 6-year time window.
- The graduation rates of these students includes the pandemic, which affected all of higher education negatively.



New Transfers make up roughly the same percentage between the Public Universities and the Privates, with a 4-percentage point gain from 2018 to 2021 for the public universities.







Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall 2018-19 and Fall 2021-22 Enrollment Collections – New Transfer Full-Time Students.

What does the retention and advancement rate look like by sector? Generally, Public Universities have higher retention and advancement rates for transfers.

Retention and Advancement of New Transfer Full-Time Students



7

Illinois community college transfers have higher retention and advancement rates than overall transfers. The gap between public universities and private's has decreased.

Retention and Advancement of New IL CC Transfer Full-Time Students



Overall graduation rates for Illinois Community College transfers are higher at the Public Universities. Overall transfer graduation rates are high.



Four-year graduation rate at Public Universities



Illinois public and private universities retain and advance lower proportions of African American transfers relative to their white counterparts. The class advancement gap is larger.



Retention and Advancement of New Transfer Full-Time Students



Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall 2018-19 to Fall 2022-23 Enrollment Collections – New Transfer Full-Time Students from Fall of AY2018-19, Fall of AY2019-20, Fall of AY2020-21, Fall of AY2021-22 tracked to the next Fall.

10

Illinois community college African American transfers have a smaller retention rate gap with white transfers.



Retention and Advancement of New IL CC Transfer Full-Time Students



Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall 2018-19 to Fall 2022-23 Enrollment Collections – New Transfer Full-Time Students from Fall of AY2018-19, Fall of AY2019-20, Fall of AY2020-21, Fall of AY2021-22 tracked to the next Fall.

11

Overall graduation rates among Illinois community college African American transfers are higher than transfer students in total, with a smaller gap.



% of African American Transfers Graduated and Gap to Whites



Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall Enrollment 2018-19 Enrollment and Graduation AY2018-2022 – First-Time Transfer Students from Fall of AY2018-19 tracked to AY2021-22

In the latest cohort, Illinois public universities retain and advance Latino transfers around five percentage points below whites, but higher than the privates. The gap for privates is around 3 percentage points. Advancements rates gaps are smaller and are negligible for the private institutions. Retention and Class Advancement of New Full-Time

100% 100% 86.4% 84.8% 84.5% 83.8% 80.7% 78.5% 77.5% 76.8% 80% 80.6% 80% 82.9% 79.5% 79.6% 75.1% 70.7% 66.0% 73.6% 67.7% 70.1% 64.5% 63.4%73.3% 67.6% 65.1% 60% 60% 65.5% 65.0% 65.1% 64.6% 64.0% 63.9% 62.8% 62.6% 40% 40% 20% 20% 0% 0% 2018-2019 2019-2020 2020-2021 2021-2022 2018-2019 2019-2020 2020-2021 2021-2022 Public Universities Retention Latino Private and Out-of-State Institutions Retention Latino Public Universities Retention White Private and Out-of-State Institutions Retention White Public Universities Advancement Latino Private and Out-of-State Institutions Advancement Latino Public Universities Advancement White Private and Out-of-State Institutions Advancement White

Transfer Students



Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall 2018-19 to Fall 2022-23 Enrollment Collections – New Transfer Full-Time Students from Fall of AY2018-19, Fall of AY2019-20, Fall of AY2020-21, Fall of AY2021-22 tracked to the next Fall.

Retention and advancement gaps are small to negative between Latino and white IL CC transfer students.

Retention and Class Advancement of New IL CC Transfer Full-Time Transfer Students





Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall 2018-19 to Fall 2022-23 Enrollment Collections – New Transfer Full-Time Students from Fall of AY2018-19, Fall of AY2019-20, Fall of AY2020-21, Fall of AY2021-22 tracked to the next Fall.

Graduation rates of all Latino transfers and those transferring from Illinois community colleges are similar with similar gaps. Graduation rates are lagging indicator's and there is still a graduation rate gap between Latinos and whites.





Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall Enrollment 2018-19 Enrollment and Graduation AY2018-2022 – First-Time Transfer Students from Fall of AY2018-19

tracked to AY2021-22

Illinois public universities retain and advance low-income transfers at slightly lower rates as non-low-income transfers. Illinois private's have a similar gap, though retention and advancement rates are lower.

Retention and Advancement of New Full-Time Transfer Students By Pell Status



The retention gaps with transfers from Illinois community colleges are very small for the public universities and are around 1 percentage point for the privates. Again, the retention and advancement rates are higher for IL CC transfers.

Retention and Advancement of New IL CC Transfer Full-Time Students By Pell Status



Low-income transfers from Illinois Community Colleges do slightly better than all low-income transfers, with a slightly smaller gap relative to non-low-income students.



% of Low-Income Transfers Graduated and Gap to Non-Low-Income



Main Takeaways

- Transfer students in Illinois are doing quite well.
- In most instances, transfers to Illinois public universities and privates from Illinois community colleges do better than all transfer students.
- However, retention and advancement gaps between black transfers and their white peers have persisted.
- Illinois is a leader in getting the students who transfer through to bachelor's degree completion.



Transfers National Student Clearinghouse Analysis – Logistic Regression Model



Graduation Rates

- Graduation is a lagging indicator. It is the culmination of a student's college experience since the transfer in the Fall of 2018. The time horizon is 6 years for this study. Giving a freshman transfer almost 6 academic years to graduate.
- The graduation rates of these students includes the pandemic, which affected all of higher education negatively.



Logistic Regression Modeling

- Logistic Regression is a predictive algorithm using independent variables to predict the dependent variable (graduation).
- We are using the logistic regression model to <u>find characteristics</u> of the students and schools that can significantly predict bachelor completion.



In the model, the following characteristics were found to be significant predictors of the fall 2018 transfers for bachelor completion. Though Illinois Community College transfers were also significant predictors, the class level measured very closely with CC transfers and was a better predictor of completion, so we used class level.

Let's take a look at these variables individually with regards to graduation in the following section.

variables in the Equation						
	В	S.E.	Wald	df	Sig.	Exp(B)
Step 1 ^ª ED_FULL_TIME(PT compared to FT)	-1.317	0.065	411.805	1	0.000	0.268
ED_HIGH_SCHOOL_GPA	0.060	0.015	15.486	1	0.000	1.062
ED_PELL_FLAG(DN Receive PELL compared to received PELL)	0.223	0.049	20.504	1	0.000	1.250
IOState(Out of state Fall2018 compared to In-StateFall2018)	-0.959	0.057	287.792	1	0.000	0.383
Race3model (WHITE)			169.094	2	0.000	
Race3model(Black compared to white)	-0.846	0.065	168.962	1	0.000	0.429
Race3model(Latino compared to white)	-0.243	0.062	15.445	1	0.000	0.784
ED_CLASS_LEVEL (FR)			458.871	3	0.000	
ED_CLASS_LEVEL(SO. compared to FR)	0.780	0.060	169.806	1	0.000	2.181
ED_CLASS_LEVEL(JR. compared to FR)	1.245	0.063	390.736	1	0.000	3.474
ED_CLASS_LEVEL(SR. compared to FR)	1.446	0.114	161.470	1	0.000	4.246
Constant	0.345	0.065	27.712	1	0.000	1.412

Variables in the Equation



Source: IBHE IHEIS Fall Enrollment 2018– Bachelor-seeking New Transfer Students from Fall of AY2018-19 tracked with National Student Clearinghouse

Transfers National Student Clearinghouse Analysis – Graduation Rates by Student and College Characteristics



NSC Cohort Study

- Included in all the tables are bachelor degree-seeking students who transferred Fall 2018 to an Illinois 4-year institution. Part-time students are included in this study.
- All student and college variables are set for a student as of the time of the Fall 2018 transfer.
- Using the NSC data we can track whether a student graduated anywhere in the US if they transferred again after Fall 2018.
- NSC data for graduation was available up to June, 2024, roughly 6 academic years from Fall 2018.



Overall, new transfers have a graduation rate of 63.7%, with students who transferred to Public Universities outperforming the other sectors.



Graduation Rate of New Transfer Students by Transfer School's Sector



Full-time students graduate at a higher rate than part-time students.



Graduation Rate of New Transfer Students by Full-time Status



As expected, the higher the class level the higher the graduation rate.



Graduation Rate of New Transfer Students by Class Level



Latino students have around a 4 percentage point lower graduation rate than white students. Black students have graduation rates that are 18 percentage points lower than white students. Institutions need to look at ways to lessen this gap for black transfers.



Graduation Rate of New Transfer Students by Race/Ethnicity



Students who Do Not Receive PELL (non-low-income) graduate at a higher rate than those who receive PELL (low-income).



Graduation Rate of New Transfer Students by PELL Recipient



Illinois students have the highest graduation rate, significantly higher than out-ofstate students. International students may have been affected by the pandemic.





Students who transfer from the Illinois Community College System graduate at a higher rater than those that do not.





After adding the student's initial class level, students who transfer from the Illinois Community College System still consistently graduate at a higher rate than those that do not transfer from the Illinois Community College System.

100% 90% 76.4% 80% 74.6% 72.5% 68.7% 70% 65.4% 56.8% 60% 52.5% 50% 40% 35.0% 30% 20% 10% 0% ILCC Transfer Not an ILCC Not an ILCC ILCC Transfer Not an ILCC Not an ILCC ILCC Transfer IICC Transfer Transfer Transfer Transfer Transfer Freshman Senior Sophomore Junior

Graduation Rate of New Transfer Students by Class Level and IL Community College Transfer Status



Main Takeaways

- Illinois transfer students who in Fall 2018 were from Illinois, have higher graduation rates than those who aren't.
- Institutions have persistent graduation gaps between black transfers and their white peers. Institutions need to look at ways to lessen and eliminate this gap.
- Students not receiving PELL (non-low-income) have a higher probability of graduating with a bachelor's degree than those who receive PELL (low-income).
- Students that transfer from an Illinois Community College (ILCC) to attend an Illinois 4-year institution graduate at a higher rate than those that transfer from a non-ILCC school.
- Students who transferred to a Public University, graduate at the highest rate of any sector.

